

CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

The City of Duluth is progressing in meeting the goals listed in the 2015-2019 Strategic Plan and in the 2016 Action Plan. The Public Service goal was exceeded. Although there were no completions for Public Facilities, progress was made on all of the construction projects. It is anticipated that all of the current Public Facility activities will be completed by the end of the 2016 Program Year on March 31, 2018 and reported in the next CAPER. This year it was difficult to complete construction projects in a timely manner due to a lack of skilled construction workers in the City of Duluth, and a particularly challenging long winter. In addition, there were a number of large scale market development projects during this past year that put an additional strain on getting competitive bids and construction workers. Housing has two rehab activities: Rental Units Rehabilitation-which did not meet the goal, this is primarily due to the 150 rehab project, Gateway, that is near completion (the goal will be met when this building is complete). 2). Homeowner rehab-which met its goal. The two housing construction goals of homeownership and rental units will be the focus for future program years. Economic Development is focusing more on job training for construction workers. This is a 2.5 year program; therefore progress is being made towards its goal and it is expected to meet its goal in next year's CAPER.

Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee's program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Affordable Home Owner Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$28000 / HOME: \$115018	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	50	3	6.00%	3	3	100.00%

Affordable Home Owner Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$28000 / HOME: \$115018	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	725	127	17.52%	40	61	152.50%
Affordable Rental Housing	Affordable Housing Public Housing Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units constructed	Household Housing Unit	300	0	0.00%			
Affordable Rental Housing	Affordable Housing Public Housing Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	250	163	65.20%	250	107	42.80%
Community Development Infrastructure	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	100	0	0.00%			
Community Development Infrastructure	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	1		%			

Community Public Facilities	Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0		15600	0	0.00%
Community Public Facilities	Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	7	0	0.00%			
Economic Development	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	163	61	37.42%	41	36	87.80%
Economic Development	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Businesses assisted	Businesses Assisted	40	24	60.00%	7	8	114.29%
Homelessness	Homeless	ESG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	19400	49344	254.35%	17879	23951	133.96%
Homelessness	Homeless	ESG: \$	Tenant-based rental assistance / Rapid Rehousing	Households Assisted	350	33	9.43%	18	20	111.11%
Homelessness	Homeless	ESG: \$	Homeless Person Overnight Shelter	Persons Assisted	6000	3307	55.12%	1785	1856	103.98%

Homelessness	Homeless	ESG: \$	Overnight/Emergency Shelter/Transitional Housing Beds added	Beds	1785	1825	102.24%	0	0	
Homelessness	Homeless	ESG: \$	Homelessness Prevention	Persons Assisted	300	307	102.33%	50	172	344.00%
Neighborhood Revitalization	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Buildings Demolished	Buildings	10	8	80.00%			
Neighborhood Revitalization	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	0	0		1	1	100.00%
Public Services	Homeless Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	104670	47393	45.28%	17579	22010	125.21%
Public Services	Homeless Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	19400	3972	20.47%			
Public Services	Homeless Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Homeless Person Overnight Shelter	Persons Assisted		0		1490	1516	101.74%
Tenant Based Rental Assistance	Homeless	HOME: \$	Tenant-based rental assistance / Rapid Rehousing	Households Assisted	100	38	38.00%	18	25	138.89%

Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date

Assess how the jurisdiction's use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.

Although all of the activities are important, housing is becoming a higher concern. The lack of affordable housing is impacting public agencies, especially the ones who assist people currently experiencing homelessness or other housing crisis. The current rental rate is at 2.5% for market rate rentals and under 1% for public housing, which makes housing options very limited. The City recently developed a Housing Action Framework Plan to address this issue and will be working closely with housing agencies, subgrantees and the Duluth HRA Staff to achieve the goals listed in the Strategic Plan in the Consolidated Plan and in the corresponding Action Plans. A primary focus will be the construction of new affordable rental units and housing rehab. There are two proposed projects for affordable rental units, one project would add 50 units and the other project would add 40 units. Currently they are being reviewed for Tax Credit financing.

CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG	HOME	ESG
White	14,980	80	831
Black or African American	3,388	24	360
Asian	114	0	5
American Indian or American Native	3,451	22	324
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	8	0	1
Total	21,941	126	1,521
Hispanic	396	0	45
Not Hispanic	21,545	126	1,476

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

Narrative

According to the 2015 ACS 5 year estimate; the racial and ethnic composition in Duluth is 91% White, 3% Black or African American, 2% American Indian or American Native, and the remaining 4% are other racial and ethnic groups. HUD funds assisted the racial and ethnic groups with the percentages: 67% White, 16% Black or African American, and 16% American Indian or American Native; 1% of funds assisted other racial and ethnic groups.

CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	CDBG	2,470,240	2,499,594
HOME	HOME	471,958	634,635
HOPWA	HOPWA		
ESG	ESG	198,963	172,513
Other	Other		

Table 3 - Resources Made Available

Narrative

Funds were appropriately spent for the 2016 Program Year. Although the amount expended on Public Services exceeded the 15% limitation, it was allowable due to the overage being spent for the SOAR activity.

SOAR Career Solutions is a qualified Community Based Development Organization (CBDO) that is able to carry out job training activities under the Economic Development category. The project Duluth at Work Collaborative received \$272,000 to conduct job training for 45 candidates. Under the HUD regulations 24 CFR 570.204, CBDO's are exempted from the HUD Public Service Cap.

Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description

Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Narrative

City of Duluth does not have any HUD defined Target Areas.

Leveraging

Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.

When sub-grantees agencies submit applications for funding, they describe the amount of funding they receive from other funding sources and how the funds will be used to address specific needs. There were no publically owned lands used for match requirements. When the agencies submit their final invoice, they provide updated matching fund information. For the 2016 Program Year, the Lutheran Social Services Center for Changing Lives had substantial matching funds; totalling \$8,456,972 (with 41% coming from private sources and 57% from state and local funds). This project will be completed by the next CAPER.

Fiscal Year Summary – HOME Match	
1. Excess match from prior Federal fiscal year	163,391
2. Match contributed during current Federal fiscal year	8,511,972
3. Total match available for current Federal fiscal year (Line 1 plus Line 2)	8,675,363
4. Match liability for current Federal fiscal year	43,600
5. Excess match carried over to next Federal fiscal year (Line 3 minus Line 4)	8,631,763

Table 5 – Fiscal Year Summary - HOME Match Report

Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year								
Project No. or Other ID	Date of Contribution	Cash (non-Federal sources)	Foregone Taxes, Fees, Charges	Appraised Land/Real Property	Required Infrastructure	Site Preparation, Construction Materials, Donated labor	Bond Financing	Total Match

Table 6 – Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year

HOME MBE/WBE report

Program Income – Enter the program amounts for the reporting period				
Balance on hand at begin-ning of reporting period \$	Amount received during reporting period \$	Total amount expended during reporting period \$	Amount expended for TBRA \$	Balance on hand at end of reporting period \$
0	0	0	0	0

Table 7 – Program Income

Minority Business Enterprises and Women Business Enterprises – Indicate the number and dollar value of contracts for HOME projects completed during the reporting period						
	Total	Minority Business Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sub-Contracts						
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Total	Women Business Enterprises	Male			
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			
Number	0	0	0			
Sub-Contracts						
Number	0	0	0			
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			

Table 8 - Minority Business and Women Business Enterprises

Minority Owners of Rental Property – Indicate the number of HOME assisted rental property owners and the total amount of HOME funds in these rental properties assisted						
	Total	Minority Property Owners				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 9 – Minority Owners of Rental Property

Relocation and Real Property Acquisition – Indicate the number of persons displaced, the cost of relocation payments, the number of parcels acquired, and the cost of acquisition						
Parcels Acquired		0		0		
Businesses Displaced		0		0		
Nonprofit Organizations Displaced		0		0		
Households Temporarily Relocated, not Displaced		0		0		
Households Displaced	Total	Minority Property Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Cost	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 10 – Relocation and Real Property Acquisition

CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	1,736	1,914
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	290	171
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	131	614
Total	2,157	2,699

Table 11 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	18	20
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	10	0
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	280	147
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	3	3
Total	311	170

Table 12 – Number of Households Supported

Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.

The 2015-2019 Strategic Plan listed 50 Homeowner units to be added, 725 homeowner housing units to be rehabilitated, and 250 rental units to be rehabilitated, for a total number of 1025 units. For the 2016 Program Year, the goal was to provide 250 units, however 171 housing units were provided to non-homeless individuals. The goal was not met because part of the rehab goal included the 150 unit Gateway building that is currently being rehabbed. Once the Gateway building is complete, the number of non-homeless people to be provided affordable housing will be 321 people. As the Table shows, there

were no Production of New Units to report as being completed at this time; however there are units currently under construction and these units will be reported in the next CAPER.

Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.

The Gateway and the other rehabilitation activities are expected to be completed by fall of 2017, therefore we expect that the 2017 CAPER will show the City of Duluth exceeding the Action Plan goal. The City has developed a Housing Action Framework Plan, which received approval on June 12, 2017 to better coordinate housing rehab and housing development projects. This information will be in future Action Plans.

Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.

Number of Households Served	CDBG Actual	HOME Actual
Extremely Low-income	23,709	20
Low-income	1,603	9
Moderate-income	568	0
Total	25,880	29

Table 13 – Number of Households Served

Narrative Information

98% of the people served with CDBG and HOME funds were extremely low-income and low income. The City of Duluth works with agencies to promote the CDBG and HOME funded activities to serve as many people as possible.

CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)

Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:

Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs

The City of Duluth and its partners continue to identify and connect homeless individuals and families with resources. Through public service contracts, case managers meet with homeless clients to assess their individual needs, and start a case plan. The city and its partners remain dedicated to the objectives and outcomes of the consolidated plan for which identifying clients as soon as they become homeless and linking them with resources to improve their situation as soon as possible.

All contracted service providers, and the City of Duluth play active roles within the Saint Louis County Continuum of Care (CoC). Clients are encouraged to begin the process of referrals to service providers by calling 211 and participating in a questionnaire to best determine which agencies would best be able to help the individual or family. From there, an appointment is made with a case manager and the client to identify barriers, create a plan on how to regain self-sufficiency, or at the very least, regain housing immediately.

Street outreach continues to be an effective way to identify, and assist homeless persons within Duluth. Clients that are living on the streets or in places not suitable for housing take time to build relationships of trust. Outreach staff work with business and homeowners, in addition to the Duluth Police Department to learn where members of the homeless are camping with the intent of working with the client to triage them onsite, complete a VISPDAT, and get them in a safe place. Street outreach was not funded through 2016 funds; however, two street outreach programs were funded for 2017.

Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons

The City of Duluth through the ESG grant supports shelter operations and transitional housing. These housing options provide homeless families and individuals with a safe place to sleep, and keep them from staying in the outdoor elements, or in places that are not habitable. Case management is provided to clients as a way to understand their unique situations. Referrals are made that directly reflect the needs of each individual.

The need for shelter continues. In 2015, 1,482 individuals were served by emergency shelter. In 2016, that number increased to 1,856 individuals reaching the goal of serving 1,785.

Case management is provided through public service. A unique part of Duluth's homelessness are the

weekly meetings between case managers to allocate ESG Flex Funds and Saint Louis County FHPAP funds in order to keep families and individuals in their current housing. Emergency situations arise in clients lives that prevent them from paying their rent on time, losing a job, having a major medical bill, etc. putting clients in a position where they need public assistance to keep their stability. ESG Flex is able to help case managers provide assistance when clients fall behind on their utility bills or rent. This past year 172 individuals and families were able to stay in their homes because of this funding source.

Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs

The City of Duluth funds services that address housing, health, social services, employment or youth needs. The Lake Superior Health Clinic provides free dental care for low- moderate income clients. CHUM, Damiano Center, and The Salvation Army provide food banks across Duluth, or provide hot meals onsite throughout the week. MACV provides case management to veterans and their families. Life House provides a drop in center for homeless and at-risk youth. Safe Haven provides shelter for those experiencing domestic violence. SOAR provides job training and the Entrepreneur Funds assists businesses to expand and create more jobs.

The City works with the COC on discharge planning issues, as described in the ESG Standards for Consolidated Plan. The City, along with the County, funded a homeless coordinated entry program to better understand the existing needs and numbers of people currently experiencing homelessness in 2016. This information lead the City to fund additional outreach programs for 2017, which will help to evaluate the current effectiveness of ESG discharge standards (such as why did a person become homeless and what/could have been done differently). Information from the Outreach programs and working with homeless agencies will help the City and the COC to determine if changes are in needed for discharge policy and/or procedures.

Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again

In coordination with the Saint Louis County Continuum of Care (CoC), the City of Duluth elected to fund a portion of the Coordinated Entry Coordinator who manages the CoC waitlist, works with sub recipients to input data into HMIS correctly, in addition to ensuring that the hardest to house (individuals with a VISPDAT scores of 10-15) are housed as soon as units become available.

Working with the CoC, the City of Duluth is dedicated to working with sub recipients to house those that are at the top of the waiting list within a reasonable amount of time. The waitlist in Duluth alone has grown to 795 households, including 1,077 persons, as of June 2017. The waitlist had its largest growth between January and March of 2017 when 318 individuals were added to the list. Of the 795, 315 have VISPDAT scores between 10-15 and would be first to be housed as soon as units became available that fit the size of the household.

To further shorten the time of those experiencing homelessness, sub recipients, the City of Duluth, and the Saint Louis County CoC established a monthly meeting where all agencies that participate in the CoC, in addition to United Way's 211 program meet to discuss any issues with getting clients housed, share success stories, and work as a cohort to ensure that the system works well. Providing this opportunity allows consistent conversation, training of new staff, and allows for time to correct any systemic issues and improve the process.

CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)

Actions taken to address the needs of public housing

The Duluth HRA maintained its HUD-designated High Performer status in the past year, including designation as a high performer under the HUD Capital Fund program, meaning capital improvement funding provided by this grant was both obligated and spent within HUD required deadlines during the year. Consequently, many capital improvement projects were undertaken and completed, including the completion of a major energy conservation improvement project at its Grandview Manor high rise which received \$456,000 in general obligation bond funding provided by the Minnesota Housing Finance Agency (MHFA) to supplement the capital funds available for this project. Furthermore, the HRA also plans to apply for additional general obligation bond funding this year to be provided by MHFA, since the state legislature included \$20M for public housing preservation state-wide in its recently passed bonding bill.

The HRA has an excellent work order system and preventative maintenance program to keep properties in good working order. The HRA also continued to participate in the risk control program offered through its insurance company, Housing Authority Insurance Group.

The HRA continued its due diligence under the proposed HUD Rental Assistance Demonstration Program (RAD) in hopes it would provide, among other things, additional capital improvement funding. However, in December of 2016, the HRA informed HUD that it was withdrawing its two Commitments to Enter Into a Housing Assistance Payment Contract (CHAP) for Rental Assistance Demonstration (RAD) conversions of some of its public housing properties due to the HRA's determination of both financial infeasibility and a ruling by the Minnesota Housing Finance Agency that those properties included in our application that had been awarded general obligation funds for capital improvements in the past would not be eligible for any kind of transfer of ownership under RAD. Consequently, the HRA's entire public housing inventory of 1,154 units will remain under the traditional public housing program.

Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership

The HRA held regular meetings during the year with its Resident Advisory Board (RAB) and also promotes resident attendance at high rise resident club meetings. Staff are made available to attend Club meetings as warranted and requested. The HRA also has both a self-sufficiency program and a Section 8 Homeownership program, both of which were also promoted during the year. The HRA also has a Public Housing Outreach program which provides various information and referral of interest to residents on a regular basis.

Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs

NA

CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)

Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)

Support selective demolition: The City has been proactively removing blighted, vacant buildings. A number of those properties were damaged in the 2012 flood, and redevelopment of the site is prohibited because of the location in a flood zone. On sites with the potential for redevelopment, all waste was removed.

Complete housing rehabs: CDBG and HOME funded rehab projects were completed, with all code and lead-based paint issues addressed, and the housing units assessed for healthy home deficiencies.

Vacant properties in LMI neighborhoods: One Roof acquired, rehabbed and sold homes that were formerly vacant or foreclosed properties in the Central and East Hillside, Lincoln Park and West Duluth neighborhoods. The properties will be enrolled in One Roof's Community Land Trust program, which will preserve long-term affordability of the housing in these neighborhoods, while also encouraging homeownership.

Energy requirements: Energy efficiency was increased by at least 20% by rehab projects in existing homes.

TBRA for "hard to house": HOME Program funds were used to provide rental subsidies for homeless individuals and families, and those with multiple barriers to securing adequate housing.

Historic property surveys: The city was successful in securing \$20,000 in funding from the Minnesota Historical Society's Legacy Grant program to survey historic properties in the Lincoln Park neighborhood. The survey includes both residential and commercial properties, and will serve to accelerate the residential rehab process and enhance opportunities for business incubation in this lower income neighborhood. The survey will be finalized for adoption in July 2017.

Tax forfeit redevelopment: The timeframe for tax forfeiture has been reduced significantly. City and County staff continue to work on revising policies to allow for faster redevelopment of tax forfeit land.

Rental license policies: The Tenant Landlord Connection is working to see what opportunities there are to ease the burden on renters, such as common applications and universal background checks.

Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

HOME funds were assisted in the construction of the Center for Changing Lives, a Lutheran Social Services supportive building located to provide homeless youths with services, and transitional and

permanent housing. This building is located on a bus route, very close to the Super One grocery store, Rite-Aid, hospitals, and other services. CDBG funds were also awarded for the construction of a greenhouse, promoted by the West Duluth and Lincoln Park Food Access and Education initiative to provide food in underserved areas. Tenant-based rental assistance was provided to help homeless, formerly homeless and “hard to house” person secure affordable housing. This assistance contributes to the coordinated entry system in Duluth.

Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The City partnered with the Duluth HRA through 2016 and into 2017 to address lead based paint reduction. Through the Duluth HRA’s housing rehabilitation program, the HRA maintained several inspectors on staff with lead certifications, allowing for timely and thorough review of lead based paint risks in remodeling and affordable housing preservation projects. During the program year, City and HRA staff participated in the HUD Lead & Healthy Housing Conference. The City discussed lead exposure with all sub-grantees, including an additional module during the risk monitoring assessment that provided new practical information to sub-grantees about how to be sure they are communicating with clients about the risks of lead exposure. The City also followed up with sub-grantees to ensure required lead risk disclosures were being properly documented.

Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

During the course of the program year, the City collaborated with partners to review services to families that might be experiencing or were at risk of poverty. Through strong partnerships with sub-grantees like Center City Housing and CHUM, services were provided to at-risk families at housing developments such as the Steve O’Neill Apartments, at the CHUM Shelter, and through programs like the Neighborhood Youth Services (NYS) JET Food program. The City worked with sub-grantee NYS to discuss options for expanded job training for at-risk youth, focused on one of Duluth’s job growth sectors, food services. The City also collaborated with NYS to find space for a new program that NYS was working to establish that would provide counseling services to families in poverty. The City continued its funding of the Lake Superior Community Health Center, which provides medical and dental services to at-risk families. The City worked with its affordable housing providers to consider future options for family supportive housing.

Support by CDBG funds, Duluth at Work helps low income people find jobs and increase their income. A collaboration of three agencies, with support from the City of Duluth and Local Initiatives Support Corporation, Duluth at Work prepares individuals for employment at for-profit business and

helps low income business owners to increase their revenue. In 2016, 36 people were trained and people secured jobs and businesses were assisted in expanding to create more job opportunities.

Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

In 2015, the Tenant Landlord Connection (formerly called the Housing Access Center) was established in the Central Hillside Community building, managed and staffed by One Roof. The mission of the TLC is to educate landlords and tenants regarding their rights and responsibilities, mediate disputes and avoid evictions whenever possible, provide Ready to Rent classes for students and hopeful tenants without a positive rental history, and refer people experiencing discrimination to Fair Housing entities.

Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The City and St. Louis County (SLC) worked together to secure federal, state and local resources and to ensure coordination of services for homeless families and individuals. During the year, both of the primary staff persons from the City and SLC who had lead the effort to implement the continuum of care left their jobs for new endeavors. Additional staff were hired at the City and County to provide leadership for the 10- Year Plan to End Homelessness. Also, the Duluth HRA took on the management of the coordinated entry system in Duluth. These personnel changes have provided new direction for coordinated entry, the continuum of care process, and oversight by the Heading Home SLC Leadership Council. Relationships with the emergency shelters, transitional housing and other housing and homeless service provider agencies have been strengthened, and cooperation between all of the entities working within the continuum has increased.

Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)

The two major impediments identified in the fair housing choice analysis are 1) lack of information and education and 2) insufficient data to support enforcement. The City funded the Tenant Landlord Connection (TLC) to educate tenants and landlords about their rights and provide mediation services to reduce evictions and fair housing violations. A fair housing and reasonable accommodations training have been scheduled through out the year. The City's new Human Rights Officer has been actively involved in providing information to people about their rights and opportunities about housing opportunities. The City has an active Human Rights Commission and a Disabilities Commission where affordable housing needs are actively discussed.

CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230

Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements

All CDBG, HOME and ESG funded programs receive this type of monitoring based upon a risk assessment. Every individual community development project is monitored annually. This is done through either a program desk monitoring or by an on-site monitoring that inspects and reviews client records. For 2016, Community Development staff conducted on-site monitoring visits for 11 CDBG, 2 ESG projects, and 2 for HOME projects and conducted eighteen desk monitorings. Annually, a financial monitoring is conducted on programs that administer revolving loan funds on behalf of the City. At the onsite visits, staff verified that program activities are meeting a national objective, serving homeless people, operating rental properties within rent and income limits, and that funds are expended appropriately on eligible activities. For the 2017 Program Year, staff will develop new standards for documentation based on comments received during the HUD monitoring visit in 2016.

Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)

Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.

The CAPER was made available for public review on June 13, 2017, with hard copies in the City of Duluth Clerk's Office and in the Community Planning Office. Three hard copies were distributed to the Duluth Public Library, which has three branch in different geographic areas (two of the areas are predominantly low-income). The CAPER was also available for review online on the Community Planning page of the City's website www.duluthmn.gov. A public hearing was held on June 20, 2017, conducted by the Community Development Committee in accordance with the Citizen Participation Plan. A copy of the minutes are attached. Notice of the CAPER and the hearing were in the paper, sent to agencies and announced at public meetings. Minutes of the public hearing are attached.

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

During the 2016 program year, the Community Planning division sought to modify its grant funding process after consideration of options for providing opportunities for new grantees. The changes included a few of options for fiscal sponsorship for potential grant applicants who may not yet have sufficient organizational capacity to apply under the typical parameters of the City. The objective of this proposal was to create opportunities for new non-profit organizations headed by individuals of a minority or similar background to participate. Staff had several meetings with potentially qualifying applicants, but the applicants ultimately determined that the barriers to applying were too high, and were concerned about the timing of fund availability, and ultimately no new applicants were funded for the 2017 program year. The City continues to work and encourage new applicants and programs to apply.

Staff at the City is currently working closely with its appointed Community Development Committee representatives to set the funding model for the 2018 program year, including incorporating the recommendations from the new adopted Housing Action Framework Plan.

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

No

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.

CR-50 - HOME 91.520(d)

Include the results of on-site inspections of affordable rental housing assisted under the program to determine compliance with housing codes and other applicable regulations

Please list those projects that should have been inspected on-site this program year based upon the schedule in §92.504(d). Indicate which of these were inspected and a summary of issues that were detected during the inspection. For those that were not inspected, please indicate the reason and how you will remedy the situation.

In total, there are nine rental properties that have received HOME funds still within the affordability period. Of these, four rental properties required onsite physical inspections and file review. The Duluth HRA provides building inspection services, as their staff are certified Building Inspectors and Lead-Based Paint assessors. The inspected properties were:

Vet’s Place	Owner: Minnesota Veterans Assistance Council	Six Year Inspection
Gimaajii	Owner: AICHO	Six Year Inspection
Upper Trans. Building	Owner: Center City Housing	Six Year Inspection
Lower Trans. Building	Owner: Center City Housing	Six Year Inspection

The Duluth HRA reports that unit and buildings have all passed the required inspection standards for the HOME Program, and are in compliance.

Provide an assessment of the jurisdiction's affirmative marketing actions for HOME units. 92.351(b)

Of the total HOME units, 65.5% reported as White; 18% Black/African American; 15% American Indian; and 1.5% multi-racial. The Tenant-Based Rental Assistance program vouchers served 40% non-white persons; 17% of homebuyers were American Indian; and 14% of homeowner rehab recipients. Non-white persons are benefiting from HOME assistance at a much higher rate than their percentages of Duluth’s population as a whole. This shows the success of affirmative marketing activities.

Refer to IDIS reports to describe the amount and use of program income for projects, including the number of projects and owner and tenant characteristics

NA, Program Income was not used during the 2016 program year.

Describe other actions taken to foster and maintain affordable housing. 91.220(k) (STATES ONLY: Including the coordination of LIHTC with the development of affordable housing). 91.320(j)

The City works closely with the Minnesota Housing Finance Agency and other state agencies in supporting affordable housing developments in Duluth. In 2016, two housing projects received State and local support for projects that will be completing construction in 2017. Lutheran Social Services is constructing the Center for Changing Lives, a building to include services for homeless youth, transitional housing and permanent supportive housing. Gateway Towers, a 150-unit high-rise apartment building primarily serving low-income senior citizens and persons with disabilities was at risk of foreclosure. This project was funded for major rehabilitation to preserve these very affordable units, and fill a gap of affordable housing units.

CR-60 - ESG 91.520(g) (ESG Recipients only)

ESG Supplement to the CAPER in *e-snaps*

For Paperwork Reduction Act

1. Recipient Information—All Recipients Complete

Basic Grant Information

Recipient Name	DULUTH
Organizational DUNS Number	077627883
EIN/TIN Number	416005105
Identify the Field Office	MINNEAPOLIS
Identify CoC(s) in which the recipient or subrecipient(s) will provide ESG assistance	Duluth/Saint Louis County CoC

ESG Contact Name

Prefix	Mr
First Name	Keith
Middle Name	0
Last Name	Hamre

Suffix 0
Title Director

ESG Contact Address

Street Address 1 208 City Hall
Street Address 2 411 West First Street
City Duluth
State MN
ZIP Code -
Phone Number 2187305480
Extension 0
Fax Number 0
Email Address khamre@duluthmn.gov

ESG Secondary Contact

Prefix Mr
First Name Adam
Last Name Fulton
Suffix 0
Title Manager
Phone Number 2187305325
Extension 0
Email Address Afulton@duluthmn.gov

2. Reporting Period—All Recipients Complete

Program Year Start Date 04/01/2016
Program Year End Date 03/31/2017

3a. Subrecipient Form – Complete one form for each subrecipient

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: DULUTH
City: DULUTH
State: MN
Zip Code: 55802,
DUNS Number: 077627883
Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N
Subrecipient Organization Type: Unit of Government
ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 198963

CR-65 - Persons Assisted

4. Persons Served

4a. Complete for Homelessness Prevention Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	0
Children	0
Don't Know/Refused/Other	44
Missing Information	0
Total	44

Table 16 – Household Information for Homeless Prevention Activities

4b. Complete for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	29
Children	7
Don't Know/Refused/Other	61
Missing Information	0
Total	97

Table 17 – Household Information for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

4c. Complete for Shelter

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	969
Children	19
Don't Know/Refused/Other	533
Missing Information	0
Total	1,521

Table 18 – Shelter Information

4d. Street Outreach

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	0
Children	0
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	0

Table 19 – Household Information for Street Outreach

4e. Totals for all Persons Served with ESG

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	1,170
Children	351
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	1,521

Table 20 – Household Information for Persons Served with ESG

5. Gender—Complete for All Activities

	Total
Male	921
Female	599
Transgender	1
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	1,521

Table 21 – Gender Information

6. Age—Complete for All Activities

	Total
Under 18	351
18-24	499
25 and over	320
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	351
Total	1,521

Table 22 – Age Information

7. Special Populations Served—Complete for All Activities

Number of Persons in Households

Subpopulation	Total	Total Persons Served – Prevention	Total Persons Served – RRH	Total Persons Served in Emergency Shelters
Veterans	94	0	0	0
Victims of Domestic Violence	614	0	0	0
Elderly	62	0	0	0
HIV/AIDS	0	0	0	0
Chronically Homeless	237	0	0	0
Persons with Disabilities:				
Severely Mentally Ill	488	0	0	0
Chronic Substance Abuse	57	0	0	0
Other Disability	74	0	0	0
Total (Unduplicated if possible)	619	0	0	0

Table 23 – Special Population Served

Housing Charts

HUD requires providers to enter homeless information into the HMIS system. The HMIS report will be submitted as an appendix to this CAPER. The information in Charts 4a, 4b, 4c, and 4e is only a summary.

CR-70 – ESG 91.520(g) - Assistance Provided and Outcomes

10. Shelter Utilization

Number of New Units - Rehabbed	0
Number of New Units - Conversion	0
Total Number of bed-nights available	264,260
Total Number of bed-nights provided	211,408
Capacity Utilization	80.00%

Table 24 – Shelter Capacity

11. Project Outcomes Data measured under the performance standards developed in consultation with the CoC(s)

Of the nine performance standards developed for CoC's six of the Saint Louis County CoC's were met. Original benchmarks created by Saint Louis County CoC were higher than ones set by HUD.

Only sixty percent of participants within CoC SSO funded projects achieved housing stability compared to the 80% benchmark that was set by HUD. Within the past year, flipping CoC funded units in a timely manner after a move out was not accomplished due to issues with staff retention. This number also affected the SLC CoC's occupancy rates which was lower than in 2015. SLC CoC staff, have restructured expectations for sub recipients and are confident that AHR rates will increase in the 2017 funding year.

Duluth has 724 total beds that are run through the Coordinated Entry system. Within the Saint Louis County CoC, there are a total of 1,186 beds. Taking the 724 total beds and multiplying it by 365 days in a year created a total of 264,260 bed-nights available. Of those nights, 80% of the beds were occupied, which gave a total of 211,408 beds provided throughout the last year. Providers continue to meet monthly to discuss local bed openings, and how the process of connecting clients with those beds in a timely manner. It is anticipated that this percentage will increase within the next year.

Fourteen percent of CoC funded permanent supportive housing projects were able to increase clients earned income. This statistic is compared to HUD's 20% benchmark. Jobs in the northland continue to pay less than the median hourly wage in Minnesota. Many clients have reported looking for more than one job to make enough to become self-sufficient without relying on public assistance programs for help. The CoC also missed a second benchmark that had four percent of participants in CoC funded support service programs that were able to increase their income from entrance into the program to the required six-month follow-up date. The benchmark for this objective nationally is set at 20%.

The CoC did have three objectives of which they performed higher than the national benchmark. Seventy-nine percent of participants in CoC permanent housing obtained non-case benefits from their

entrance into the program to their exit of the program. The national benchmark for this objective is 63%. The CoC also scored well with 86% of participants in CoC funded transitional housing were able to obtain non-case benefits from the date of entry to exiting the program. This was 23% over the national objective. Finally, the CoC had 86% of participants within SSO programs obtain non-case benefits from entry dates to their exit.

The CoC and their sub recipients met three other benchmarks at the same level as the nationally recommended rate. These objectives have to do with clients achieving housing stability in permanent and transitional housing projects, clients exiting transitional housing into permanent housing, and clients that were in transitional housing projects increasing their income.

CR-75 – Expenditures

11. Expenditures

11a. ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2014	2015	2016
Expenditures for Rental Assistance	24,426	23,032	1,018
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance	0	0	0
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services	0	0	0
Expenditures for Homeless Prevention under Emergency Shelter Grants Program	0	0	0
Subtotal Homelessness Prevention	24,426	23,032	1,018

Table 25 – ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

11b. ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2014	2015	2016
Expenditures for Rental Assistance	36,753	34,583	659
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance	0	0	0
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services	0	0	0
Expenditures for Homeless Assistance under Emergency Shelter Grants Program	0	0	0
Subtotal Rapid Re-Housing	36,753	34,583	659

Table 26 – ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

11c. ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2014	2015	2016
Essential Services	0	0	0
Operations	104,549	19,989	79,759
Renovation	0	0	0

Major Rehab	0	0	0
Conversion	0	0	0
Subtotal	104,549	19,989	79,759

Table 27 – ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter

11d. Other Grant Expenditures

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2014	2015	2016
Street Outreach	0	0	0
HMIS	0	3,100	0
Administration	5,935	1,439	0

Table 28 - Other Grant Expenditures

11e. Total ESG Grant Funds

Total ESG Funds Expended	2014	2015	2016
	171,663	82,143	81,436

Table 29 - Total ESG Funds Expended

11f. Match Source

	2014	2015	2016
Other Non-ESG HUD Funds	151,525	109,368	144,008
Other Federal Funds	3,393,535	2,839,530	2,724,747
State Government	2,778,969	258,669	609,381
Local Government	0	0	0

Private Funds	2,891,489	919,800	519,620
Other	3,893,834	1,727,323	1,437,098
Fees	0	0	0
Program Income	0	0	0
Total Match Amount	13,109,352	5,854,690	5,434,854

Table 30 - Other Funds Expended on Eligible ESG Activities

11g. Total

Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities	2014	2015	2016
	13,281,015	5,936,833	5,516,290

Table 31 - Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities

Attachment

CAPER Public Hearing



*Duluth Community Development Program Mission is to invest in community programs that help low to moderate income people by addressing **basic needs**, providing **affordable housing** and increasing economic **self-sufficiency**.*

City of Duluth
Community Development Committee
June 20, 2017 5:30 PM
City Hall Room 303
Meeting Summary

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Attending: Randy Brody, Abigail Mlinar, Hamilton Smith, Mark Othus, Nolan Makowsky, Debra Branley

Absent: Cruz Mendoza

Staff Present: Adam Fulton, Ben VanTassel, Suzanne Kelley, Kate Van Daele

Chair Brody welcomed Nolan Makowsky and noted that remain two vacancies on the Community Development Committee.

2. CAPER Public Hearing

Overview of the Public Hearing Purpose

Manager Adam Fulton provided an overview of the purpose of the CAPER. He noted that the CAPER serves as a report to HUD as a progress report on the programs that were funded through the City of Duluth Community Development Program. Information from the summary of accomplishments, financial reports, in addition to a review of the goals of programs is put into a document that is generated from Integrated Disbursement Information System (IDIS).

The CAPER in addition to serving as an annual report looks at progress being made towards goals made in the City of Duluth Consolidated Plan. The Consolidated Plan sets goals based on needs of the Duluth Community and gives a timeline of five years to fund and accomplish those goals.

This report is made available to the public, in addition to the public hearing, as a way to gather input from the community of the accomplishments, or questions about programs that were funded. No comments have been received to date.

Review of 2016 CAPER & Monitoring Process

Suzanne Kelley provided an overview of the CAPER document and the process leading to its development. Monitoring takes place annually either by a desk or an on-site file review. This year, staff participated in both on-site and desk reviews based on risk analysis of the various organizations.

Public comments are added to the CAPER, and the final report is published and sent to HUD to review.

Public Comment

Chair Randy Brody opened the floor for public comment at 5:45. No speakers addressed the Committee.

3. Fiscal Year 2016 Sub-recipient Updates

a. Duluth Housing and Redevelopment Authority – Housing Resource Connection

Jill Keppers, HRA executive director, stated that the HRA met their goal and that no issues were identified in the monitoring. Suggestions were provided during monitoring as to how files could better maintained regarding these programs. Lack of contractors bidding on projects does not result in enough competition; the HRA is interested in finding additional contractors to bid on projects.

b. Duluth Housing and Redevelopment Authority – Tenant Based Rental Assistance

Jill Keppers, HRA executive director, stated that the HRA served 25 households which was above the goal of 18. TBRA did not have any issues that were identified through monitoring.

c. Duluth Housing and Redevelopment Authority – Coordinated Entry

Jill Keppers, HRA executive director, shared that the HRA develops, manages and maintains the Coordinated Entry system. The CE Coordinator is partially funded through this program. The CE Coordinator processed 1,700+ persons processed through the waitlist which exceeded the goal of 1,000 persons. Ninety-five households were provided with housing.

d. One Roof Community Housing – Housing Resource Connection, Acq/Rehab/ Resale

Jeff Corey, One Roof executive director, stated that One Roof met their goal in 2016. The goal was to acquire three homes, of which three were acquired, rehabbed and resold. No monitoring issues were identified.

e. One Roof Community Housing – Gateway Multi-Family Housing

Jeff Corey, One Roof executive director, discussed the status of the Gateway project. It is a \$18m housing preservation project which is 75% complete. The goal is to be done by August 2017. The goal was to have 150 units rehabbed of which 75% are complete. There will be some transitional units, some will be dedicated to youth through a partnership with Life House, and COC units. Security will be enhanced when the rehab is complete increasing safety for tenants.

f. One Roof Community Housing – Tennant Landlord Connection

Jeff Corey, One Roof executive director, stated the goal was to serve 300 clients, but they served 428. Since the program was started the percentage of the clients of color is much higher than other races. The program provides stability for clients, and mediation between clients and their landlords. One Roof is continuing to work with the city and county to identify and track program outcomes.

g. SOAR Career Services – Duluth at Work Collaborative

Jason Beckman described the Duluth at Work program's goal to recruit 41 clients; instead they recruited 74 clients. The program is 30 months long, of which includes recruiting, job training and employment. Benchmarks have been very successful with 67 clients being trained and thirty-six clients obtaining employment. They will be working to ensure their clients complete training, gain employment, and retain employment. SOAR continues to work with Life House and Community Action Duluth in this collaborative. No monitoring issues were identified within this year's monitoring.

h. Entrepreneur Fund – Growing Neighborhood Businesses

Candi Broeffle discussed the 11 businesses that were trained, exceeding the goal by three businesses (the goal had been 8). One of the businesses that was trained will not meet the income goal due to not being able to operate due to health reasons. At this time, the businesses that were trained have not received their tax returns, however the staff member said that she anticipates that all of the businesses will have seen an increase in income. No issues were identified through monitoring.

- i. Life House – Homeless Youth Building Rehabilitation**
Erich Lutz discussed the progress and described the work was at least 65% complete and would be completed soon. The project is going as planned.
- j. Life House – Basic Needs Center for Homeless Youth**
Erich Lutz discussed the program. Life House served 651 youth in the drop-in center which exceeded the goal of 600. 1500 meals were provided, which was a 23% increase from 2015. One of the reasons for the increase in services was that in September 2015 HUD modified the definition of homeless youth from 23 to 24 years of age. This increased the number of participants who were able to attend services within the drop-in center. No monitoring issues were brought up during this year's review.
- k. American Indian Community Housing Organization – Dr. Robert Powless Cultural Center Improvements (formerly Trepanier Hall)**
Joe Morales discussed the program. He stated that 30% of the goal has been met so far. The elevator has been installed to date, and the roof has been bid out and is close to being under contract. Bidding and procurement for public facility projects is done by the City of Duluth. The Cultural Center hosts 500 events per year for events in the community.
- l. American Indian Community Housing Organization- Transitional and Permanent Supportive Housing Services**
Joe Morales described that the program houses the hardest to house in 29 units. AICHO had a goal of 75 clients through transitional and permanent housing and instead had 110 persons. No issues were brought up in this year's monitoring session.
- m. AICHO – Emergency Shelter**
Joe Morales described the operations of AICHO's emergency shelter. He outlined the progress and noted that AICHO had exceeded the proposed goals of the program. No monitoring issues were identified.
- n. CHUM – Duluth Hunger Project**
Scott Van Daele described the Duluth Hunger Project's goal of serving 12,000 clients through CHUM's three food shelves, The Salvation Army's food shelf, and meals served at the Damiano Center. In 2016, the Duluth Hunger Project served over 14,000 participants, exceeding the goal. No monitoring issues were identified.
- o. CHUM – CHUM Shelter**
Lee Stuart noted that CHUM exceeded the goal set forth for the shelter in 2016. She stated that CHUM saw an increase in the number of people using the CHUM shelter this year. There had been a decrease in the number of people needing shelter in the last few years, but this year they saw an increase. She provided demographic background on individuals using the shelter.
- p. Lake Superior Community Health Center – Access to Dental Health Care**
Cheryl Larsen stated the goal for this past year was 4,779 patients through their dental clinic. LSCHC served almost 1,500 clients above that goal this year. The program was able to hire a dental therapist that was able to do fillings, so the dentists are able to do extractions in addition to other more intense dental care. The program has a 2.5 year waiting list currently. This is not something that the program anticipates being able to immediately address, because of a shortage of dentists in the area, and not being able to pay dentists a salary that they might expect in the private sector. The program is collaborating with the private sector to assist patients on a pilot basis. No monitoring issues were identified.

q. Neighborhood Youth Services – JET Food Program

Princess Kisob described that NYS exceeded their goal of 500 youth by serving a total of 742 youth. NYS provided 18,199 meals and snacks throughout the year. This includes dinner and a snack during the school year. In the summer, NYS provides breakfast and lunch in addition to snacks. The program looked for restaurants and chefs to come in and teach the youth how to cook meals. An example that was given was during Black History Month was having local chefs come in to cook soul food. This was a new experience for youth who enjoyed learning about new foods, and foods that they might not be able to find in Duluth. No monitoring issues were identified during this year's visit.

r. Center City Housing Corporation – Supportive Housing

Kelly Looby shared that Center City's Family Supportive Housing provides housing to homeless individuals and families. Services for children experiencing trauma are also provided. Often children who are experiencing homelessness, are two grades behind. The program helps children to enter school at grade level once enrolled in the program. This program also provides afterschool programs for children who are older. These are not mandatory services, they are voluntary. Case management is also provided.

The goal of this program was to serve 90 clients, and 89 clients were served. The reason for not being able to meet their goal was because moving clients from out of supportive housing into independent housing was difficult. Duluth's vacancy rate of 3.3% attributes to this number of not having enough affordable housing options available for clients who do not have a Section 8 voucher, and cannot afford market rate options. No monitoring issues were identified this year.

s. Center City Housing Corporation – Permanent Supportive Housing

Kelly Looby stated that families can stay for as long as they would like. These families are referred to other organizations that can help them find jobs, go back to school, in addition to other services that assist individuals become self-sufficient. Together, Center City was able to serve 142 individuals beating their goal of 120.

t. Safe Haven – Domestic Violence Shelter

Susan Utech shared that this was the first time in many years that Safe Haven was short of their goal. Instead of serving 500 clients, they served 455. The cause was cited as individuals unable to find housing due to a poor credit rating, and/or poor rental history. Clients at Safe Haven are allowed to stay at the shelter for up to six months. Construction issues at the shelter also played a part. Flooring throughout the shelter needed to be replaced, which did not allow the shelter to accept the typical numbers of people during the summer months. These factors combined did not allow for Safe Haven to meet their goal.

Susan Utech said that the need for domestic violence shelter has not dropped. If anything, the need has increased based on what she has seen.

u. Minnesota Assistance Council for Veterans – Homeless & At-Risk Veterans Stabilization & Outreach

Lori Margret stated that this year, MACV set a goal of 80 veterans and their families in the Homeless and At-risk stabilization and outreach. Instead of serving 80 families they were able to serve 105. More veterans have been identified within St. Louis County that have identified MACV as a safe place for them to go to be a part of their shelter and transitional housing programs. No monitoring issues were identified this year.

v. The Salvation Army- Family Transitional Housing

Kristi Eckhart stated that the Salvation Army has 16 units of transitional housing. The goal was to serve 100 individuals within 2016. This past year the program served 80 individuals. Clients that has Section 8 vouchers were not able to find a unit due to the tough housing environment.

Clients are able to stay in housing for up to 24 months. This past year, clients had a greater difficulty moving into housing than has been experienced in the past. The program is not meant to force clients into homelessness. While they didn't meet their goal, the program director did not feel that this past year was a failure, she said that the program provides valuable service by building trust, referrals, and helps clients to become self-sufficient when they leave the program. No monitoring issues were identified this year.

w. Equilibrium 3 – Energy Services & Volunteer Coordinator

Jodi Slick described that Eco3 had a goal of serving 20 households through their Giving Comfort at Home program. They were able to serve the 20 households that they set out to serve. The homes served are some of the oldest homes in Duluth. There are 11,000 households that could qualify for assistance programs, that are not able to receive funds. The housing market has increased, and does not have contractors that are wanting to come in and do a \$500 job that provide weatherization services. Ninety-percent of the homes that were served were a part of Zenith Terrace mobile home development. New partnerships were created by connecting with Minnesota Energy Resources by providing natural gas services to mobile homes in Morgan Park. No monitoring issues were identified through this year's review.

x. City of Duluth – Rapid Rehousing

Kate Vane Daele, City staff, shared that through the ESG Flex program housing service providers are able to access ESG Flex funds. This year the goal was to serve 50 clients by rapidly rehousing them. A total of 172 clients were served. This program is administered by the Duluth HRA. No monitoring issues were identified during the review.

4. Other Business

- A. Approve April 18, 2017 Meeting Summary
- B. Approve May 16, 2017 Meeting Summary

MOTION/Second: Smith/Branley to approve the April 18, 2017 and May 16, 2017 meeting summaries as presented. Motion passed. **VOTE: (6-0)**

5. Communications

Housing Action Framework

Fulton explained that the Housing Action Framework was approved by the City Council at its June 12, 2017 meeting. This plan serves as an interim step between the current housing needs and the finalization of the Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan. The "New Investment" areas are intended to deconcentrate affordable housing and provide new housing near underserved areas close to job centers. The framework supported by the Administration, and will be discussed as a part of the July 10th Special Meeting. The Committee may wish to consider the HAF as it finalizes funding recommendations for 2018.

Low Income Housing Tax Credits

Fulton described the LIHTC requests for the Decker Dwellings proposal (40 units of new construction), a One Roof Community Housing development located near the Miller Hill Mall, and the Garfield Square Apartments (40 units of new construction), a proposal by Center City Housing. Both projects will hear back from Minnesota Housing and Finance Authority in October if tax credits are approved.

6. Adjourn

MOTION/Second: Smith/Branley to adjourn the meeting at 7:24 PM. Motion passed.
VOTE: (6-0)

ESG Subrecipients

City of Duluth ESG subrecipients:

CHUM- Churches United in Ministry

102 W. Second Street

Duluth, MN 555802

Executive Director- Lee Stuart

Phone-218-720-6521

Email: lstuart@chumduluth.org

Provides shelter services and outreach with ESG funds

The Salvation Army

215 South 27th Avenue West

Duluth, MN 55801

Executive Director: Kristy Greminger

Phone 218-722-7934

Email: kristy_greminger@usc.salvationarmy.org

Provides shelter services with ESG funds

Center City Housing Corp

105 ½ West 1st Street

Duluth MN, 55802

Executive Director- Rick Klun

Phone 218-606-0552

Email: rkun@centercityhousing.org

Provides shelter services with ESG funds

American Indian Community Housing Organization (AICHO)

202 West 2nd Street

Duluth MN, 55802

Executive Director- Michelle LeBeau

Phone 218-722-7225

Email: michelle.lebeau59@gmail.com

Provides shelter services with ESG funds

Life House, Inc

102 W 1st Street

Duluth MN, 55802

Executive Director- Maude Dornfeld

Phone: 218-722-7431

Email: maude.dornfeld@life-house.org

Provides outreach and shelter services with ESG funds

Safe Haven Shelter for Battered Women

PO Box 3558

Duluth MN 55803

Executive Director: Susan Utech

Phone: 218-730-2478

Email: sutech@safehavenshelter.org

Provides shelter services with ESG funds

Minnesota Assistance Council for Veterans

360 Robert Street, N. Suite 306

St. Paul, MN 55101

Executive Director: Nathaniel Saltz

Phone: 651-224-0290

Email: nsaltz@mac-v.org

Provides shelter services with ESG funds

Housing and Redevelopment Authority of Duluth AKA Duluth HRA

222 East Second Street

PO Box 16900, Duluth MN 55816

Executive Director: Jill Keppers

Phone 218-593-6320

Email: jkeppers@duluthhousing.com

Administers the Rapid Rehousing and the Prevention Fund activities with the ESG funds

2016 eCart Report



ECART Duluth
2016.xlsm